

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

NEW YORK CITY TEACHERS' RETIREMENT SYSTEM
INVESTMENT MEETING

Held on Thursday, December 1, 2022
Via Videoconference
10:05 a.m.

ATTENDEES:

- DEBRA PENNY, Chairperson, Trustee
- DAVID KAZANSKY, Trustee
- THOMAS BROWN, Trustee
- BRYAN BERGE, Trustee, Mayor's Office
- ALISON HIRSH, Trustee, Comptroller's Office
- RUSSELL BUCKLEY, Trustee
- SUSAN STANG, Teachers' Retirement System
- SAMANTHA AMILTON, Rocaton
- DEVON ALEXANDER, Rocaton
- MICHAEL FULVIO, Rocaton
- VALERIE BUDZIK, Teachers' Retirement System

REPORTED BY:
YAFFA KAPLAN
JOB NO. 8935815

1

2 ATTENDEES (Continued):

3 LIZ SANCHEZ, Teachers' Retirement System

4 THAD MCTIGUE, Teachers' Retirement System

5 DAVID LEVINE, Groom Law Group

6 STEVEN MEIER, Comptroller's Office

7 JOHN DORSA, Comptroller's Office

8 KOMIL ATAEV, Teachers' Retirement System

9 RON SWINGLE, Teachers' Retirement System

10 KATE VISCONTI, Bureau of Asset Management

11 JONATHAN LESSER, Bureau of Asset Management

12 ALLEN MACDONELL, Bureau of Asset Management

13 ROBERT FENG, Bureau of Asset Management

14 JOHN MERSEBURG, Bureau of Asset Management

15 JENNIFER GAO, Bureau of Asset Management

16 TINA SUO, Bureau of Asset Management

17 ED BERMAN, Bureau of Asset Management

18 MITCH FIELDING, Bureau of Asset Management

19 DAN HAAS, Bureau of Asset Management

20 NOZA SHUMANOV, Bureau of Asset Management

21 KAREN BARCLAY, Bureau of Asset Management

22 SANDY XU, Bureau of Asset Management

23 WILFREDO SUAREZ, Bureau of Asset Management

24 TOM CARROLL, Bureau of Asset Management

25 MAREK TSYZKIEWICZ, Office of the Actuary

1

2 ATTENDEES (Continued)::

3 JOHN ADLER, Mayor's Office

4 ISAAC GLOVINSKY, TRS

5 SUMANTE RAY, Mayor's Office

6 KEVIN LIU, Mayor's Office

7 SEAN BARBER, Hamilton Lane

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

1 Proceedings

2 MR. McTIGUE: Good morning, everyone. I
3 would like to welcome you to the Teachers'
4 Retirement System. I will call the roll.
5 Bryan Berge.

6 MR. BERGE: Bryan Berge representing
7 Mayor Eric Adams.

8 MR. McTIGUE: Thomas Brown?

9 MR. BROWN: Here.

10 MR. McTIGUE: Russell Buckley?

11 MR. BUCKLEY: Here for Panel For
12 Educational Policy Chair Dr. Angela Green
13 present.

14 MR. McTIGUE: Alison Hirsh?

15 MS. HIRSH: Here for Comptroller Brad
16 Lander.

17 MR. McTIGUE: David Kazansky?

18 MR. KAZANSKY: Present.

19 MR. McTIGUE: Debra Penny?

20 MS. PENNY: I am here. Good morning.

21 MR. McTIGUE: Madam Chair and Board
22 members, we have a quorum.

23 MS. PENNY: Thank you so much, Thad.
24 Good morning. We are going to start with the
25 third quarter 2020 review. I believe we have

1 Proceedings

2 Mike Fulvio.

3 MR. FULVIO: Great. Good morning,
4 everyone. I am going to share my screen which
5 hopefully folks are able to see. Okay. So I
6 was only going to touch upon the quarterly
7 report briefly as this was distributed ahead
8 of time, and we did previously review the
9 performance, but just as a reminder for
10 everyone, the third quarter was another market
11 selloff in both the US and abroad in terms of
12 the equity markets. In the returns here for
13 the Passport Funds. For the Diversified
14 Equity Fund about down 5 and three-quarter
15 percent for the third quarter. That brought
16 the year to date return to 9.30. The Balanced
17 Fund did notably better given it's 70 percent
18 allocation to fixed income. Though still
19 negative return at about 3.7 percent. The
20 International Equity Fund we saw a deeper
21 selloff in nonUS markets was down about 9.4
22 percent for the quarter ahead of its benchmark
23 and then the Sustainable Equity Fund down
24 about 5 percent, the US Equity Index Fund down
25 4 and a half percent and International Equity

1 Proceedings

2 Index Fund down about 10.3 percent. We will
3 touch upon a couple more detailed items in
4 this report in the executive agenda under the
5 manager update section.

6 MS. PENNY: Thank you, Mike. Does
7 anyone have any questions for Mike? Okay. We
8 hope you feel better, Michael. Next we have
9 the Passport Funds October 2022 performance
10 review. Amanda?

11 MS. JANUSZ: So Mike shared the negative
12 results for September. Thankfully for October
13 we did have positive absolute returns really
14 across the board for the funds. For the
15 Diversified Equity Fund, up about 7.2 percent
16 for the month which puts it at around negative
17 20.8 percent for the year to date period.

18 Both the passive and active components
19 contributed around 8 percent. Non-US markets
20 were more challenged than US markets during
21 the month of October, particularly China still
22 struggling from their zero COVID policy there.

23 The Balanced Fund was the worst
24 performance for the month but still positive
25 about 1.7 percent. Some of the bond

1 Proceedings
2 components of that strategy detracted down
3 around 12 percent year to date and the
4 International Equity Fund up around 4 percent
5 for October, which put it around negative 25
6 percent year to date, and some of the active
7 management there did contribute to the index
8 which returned 3 percent for the month.

9 The Sustainable Equity Fund was positive
10 3 percent for the month, which put it at
11 negative 3 -- negative 30 percent for the year
12 to date through the end of October, and you
13 can see the passive options at the bottom of
14 the page here, both the US and international
15 equities, which were in line with their
16 benchmarks. So all in all very positive month
17 after quite a few negative months in a row
18 here, so glad to see that and thankful that
19 trend has continued here into November as
20 well.

21 MS. PENNY: We really welcome you and I
22 apologize so we are joined by -- so Amanda,
23 your last name?

24 MS. JANUSZ: Janusz.

25 MS. PENNY: And Samantha?

1 Proceedings

2 MS. AMILTON: Amilton.

3 MS. PENNY: Who are two new or new to
4 our TRS's account at Rocaton, so they are
5 representing Rocaton. So welcome and if you
6 keep up the good work with giving us all
7 positive numbers, we will let you stay there.

8 MS. JANUSZ: Mike let me do the good
9 numbers.

10 MS. PENNY: That's very nice of you,
11 Michael. So let's see what Devon could do.
12 Any questions for Amanda? Okay, Devon, no
13 pressure but we have November 2022.

14 MR. ALEXANDER: I will try to keep the
15 theme consistent here. So for the month of
16 November, we expect to have positive results
17 on all fronts. Actually global market
18 composite benchmark is up positive 6.6
19 percent. And fiscal year as well I would also
20 admit it's also positive to 7.67 percent.
21 Diversified Equity Fund hybrid benchmark is
22 up, positive 6.72 percent for the month and
23 positive 7.76 for the fiscal year.

24 Switching over to the Balanced Fund
25 benchmark, again positive 3 and a quarter

1 Proceedings
2 percent, positive for the year, fiscal year
3 1.42 percent. On the international equity
4 benchmark, international composite benchmark,
5 we see astronomical results compared to the
6 domestic market, positive 11.93 percent and
7 positive for the fiscal year 3.97 percent,
8 almost 4 percent. Sustainable Equity Fund
9 benchmark we have positive almost 6 percent
10 for the Brown Advisory Sustainable Growth Fund
11 and 4.56 percent for the Sustainable Fund
12 composite benchmark.

13 Moving down to the International Equity
14 Index Fund benchmark, again 13.49 percent for
15 the month and 5.14 for the fiscal year to
16 date. So overall the themes have been
17 consistent. We have seen positive results,
18 and we hope that that continues. Although we
19 do want to caution that it may just be a bear
20 market rally, but in any event we will take
21 it.

22 MS. PENNY: Now we expect this. Thank
23 you. So any questions for Devon? Okay. Keep
24 up the good work. I don't know, Michael.
25 Looks like you are the only one that did not

1 Proceedings

2 give us good news.

3 MR. FULVIO: I was the one who fell on
4 my sword for them.

5 MS. PENNY: So now we are into the
6 public session of the pension fund and we have
7 the quarterly performance review. Steve, do
8 you want to?

9 MR. MEIER: So, thank you, Madam Chair.
10 So I put together what I thought was a short
11 slide deck and realized at 4:30 this morning
12 it's actually a lot longer than I anticipated.
13 I can't help myself, but I will go through
14 this pretty quickly. Just give you a quick
15 overview what's going on in the market and how
16 it's impacting our investments and talk about
17 performance for the third quarter.

18 So inflation continues to be a problem
19 for the US, for the Fed, for the White House.
20 It is at a near 40-year high still. It's come
21 off the boil a little bit, so I think the
22 fourth quarter more recent numbers are
23 positive in terms of the direction that they
24 are moving. We still see a significant amount
25 of rate price pressures from an employment

1 Proceedings
2 strength. We also still see a little bit
3 supply chain bottlenecks associated with the
4 lockdowns and COVID protocols in China as well
5 as energy price shocks associated with the war
6 in Russia and Ukraine. Chair Powell yesterday
7 stated in his prepared testimony that
8 inflation has spread broadly throughout the
9 economy, and their task is significant. Next
10 slide, please.

11 In terms of inflation, you can see in
12 the upper right-hand side, it's come off the
13 boil a little bit. Now it's 8 percent from a
14 CPI perspective. The core PCE deflator in
15 yellow is actually 5.1 percent. It's a little
16 stickier. It actually came in this morning at
17 5 percent for November, off of the revised 5.2
18 percent for October. So moving in the right
19 direction. Next slide.

20 Inflation certainly isn't just a
21 phenomenon here and a problem here in the US.
22 You can see the red line is the US inflation
23 measured by CPI, again coming off the boil as
24 I said. Still a big problem in the UK at 11.1
25 percent and in the European Union at 10

1 Proceedings

2 percent. Actually, 10 percent has come down
3 from 10.6 but still a problem. There has been
4 a decline in energy prices in Europe very
5 recently that moved that down a little bit but
6 still a struggle.

7 Expected inflation -- in the next slide,
8 Kate -- you can see come off the expectations
9 around the University of Michigan survey.
10 It's come down a little bit. Still pretty
11 sticky calling for 4.9 percent inflation
12 expected over the next 12 months. Employment
13 on the next slide. Employment has actually
14 been very robust. It's been little bit of a
15 challenge for the Fed. In the third quarter,
16 early fourth quarter, it was at a 50-year low,
17 3 and a half percent unemployment. You can
18 see these headlines that it came in in
19 September, 263,000 job growth. 261,000 in
20 October. We have a new November unemployment
21 report tomorrow. The expectation, the
22 consensus estimate is around 200,000, so we
23 will see where that winds up but still a
24 challenge. Next slide.

25 Again, that's a graphical depiction what

1 Proceedings
2 it reflected. 3.7 percent in the lower
3 right-hand side in white and the participation
4 rate which is something the Fed certainly
5 focuses on is still relatively low to where it
6 was pre-pandemic about a point lower. We
7 still have the post-COVID persistent imbalance
8 in our labor market. There are over 4 million
9 open positions than labor force supply and the
10 Fed hopes to balance the labor market by
11 slowing job growth. The next slide. The
12 economy actually perked up quite a bit in the
13 third quarter this year, it was revised
14 upwardly yesterday to 2.9 percent. Remember
15 that is coming off two consecutive quarters of
16 negative GDP growth in the first and second
17 quarter of this year so showing some level of
18 resilience. The fourth quarter so far looks
19 fairly to moderately strong, 3.4 percent
20 expected. Again, economic growth is still
21 powering along. You see more on a global
22 perspective on the next slide still a little
23 bit sluggish relative to where it had been,
24 and I call your attention to the red line. I
25 changed the color of this presentation.

1 Proceedings

2 That's China and you can see they have been an
3 engine for global growth, 7, 8, 9 percent
4 growth consistently for many years and they
5 are continuing to struggle with COVID, and I
6 think the expectation is around 2, 2 and a
7 half percent growth for this year. So still a
8 problem. Growth is somewhat sluggish, but we
9 will see where we go in 2023. Next slide.

10 Some of the factors impacting US growth
11 you can see there has been pretty dramatic
12 historical decline in existing single-family
13 home sales, and this actually looks at the
14 period from the Fed's first rate hike to where
15 we are today in that red lower left-hand line
16 shows there has been about a 22 percent
17 decline in family home sales since the first
18 hike in March so again, slowing down in the
19 economy here. Next slide.

20 Housing inflation is expected to come
21 down as well. We have new lease inflation
22 decline which is the green line and the
23 expectation for that to continue to 2023. And
24 the owners equivalent rent looks like it's
25 nearing a peak in expectations. That should

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

Proceedings

level off and perhaps lower. Next slide.
There is also a lot of resiliency and strength among consumers. US consumer is pretty strong right now. There had been a buildup of what's referred to as dry power, 2.6 trillion dollars. On the lower right-hand side, you can see we have been busy as an economy working that off in 2022 and spending about 620 billion dollars of that reserve. On the next slide, you can see that also corresponds with an increase in credit card and consumer debt which has moved up pretty significantly particularly for the lower wage earners, so we are getting back to normal, but I don't know if that's necessarily a healthy sign of increased credit card debt. Next slide, Kate.

In global interest rates, the Fed has been very aggressive. They have supersized rate hikes. It's on four now, four 75 basis points in addition to 50- and 25-basis-point rate hike. It only started in March so there has been a very aggressive path to raising rates quickly to fight that elevated inflation. Similarly, we have had the same

1 Proceedings
2 magnitude or perhaps not magnitude but
3 direction of hikes in Europe. There is a
4 meeting of the Fed on the 13th and 14th of
5 this month. The Fed is expected to increase
6 rates by 50 basis points, but we will see what
7 the employment report looks like tomorrow and
8 CPI looks like next week before that happens.
9 December 15th is the next ECB meeting, and the
10 expectation are for perhaps another
11 75-basis-point rate hike.

12 On this slide -- and I love this slide.
13 -- you can see on the far right-hand side the
14 hiking cycle we experienced in 2022. Again,
15 pretty dramatic and pretty straight up.
16 Compare that to some of the more recent hikes
17 in say 2014 to '15 where the Fed hiked once
18 and was on hold for about a year and went 25
19 basis points every other meeting. If you look
20 at 2003, the early part of 2000s, we have 17
21 consecutive 25-basis-point rate hikes. So
22 much more measured so this has been pretty
23 extraordinary.

24 On the lower part of that chart, it
25 shows the financial conditions index. It's

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

Proceedings

noteworthy because the financial conditions have actually eased a bit and that's not really the direction the Fed wants to go in and that's dictated by a number of things: The reduction in interest rates with increase in bond prices, the rallies we see in stocks, and a number of other factors that have kind of come off the boil. What was noteworthy about Chairman Powell's remarks yesterday were he didn't mention financial conditions which the market took as a positive side that he is not pushing back on the recent rally in prices. The next slide, Kate.

This is just a different look at again how fast and furious the Fed has been raising rates in 2022. Skip ahead, Kate, two pages, please. Credit spreads and US treasuries. The big news has been more recently in the press the 2 and 10 spreads which typically you have a yields premium associated with longer term investment bonds so 10-year yields typically and traditionally are much higher than say 2s. That market grew and is now inverted with 2 years trading around 4.32 this

1 Proceedings

2 morning relative to 10s at 350. That yield
3 spread is about negative 72 basis points.
4 It's probably going wider. It's been at an
5 all-time wide in 1981 at 250 basis points, but
6 that tells us a couple of things. It tells us
7 the market, bond market in particular is
8 pricing in recession in the coming months.
9 That's not really what we are seeing certainly
10 in the third and fourth quarters, so I think
11 2023 is going to be a more challenging year
12 for the US economy. Next slide.

13 This is just a depiction of what that
14 looks like on the left-hand side the treasury
15 yield curve. Since we last met, the 11.29
16 figure in red, on the far left-hand side of
17 the left-hand chart, you can see there has
18 been a spike in short rates relative to where
19 we are in longer term, 10-, 20-, 30-year
20 bonds. On the right-hand side, you can see
21 the 2- and 10-year spread widening out.
22 Again, it's rare and it's about 72 basis
23 points today.

24 The next slide looks at credit spreads.
25 Not a lot of news in terms of investment grade

1 Proceedings

2 spreads. It moved up a little bit in the
3 black line. The red line you see in high
4 yield spreads is a little bit more volatile.
5 Right now it's around 435 basis points over
6 comparable maturity treasuries. They have
7 been as wide as 600 and that may be driven by
8 a number of things. The fact that there
9 hasn't been a lot of high yield bond issuance
10 and both retail and institutional flows into
11 the high yield markets as those yields have
12 topped 8 to 10 percent. Next slide.

13 The dollar continues to be strong
14 although it's come off the boil a little bit.
15 It's been I would say comparatively good for
16 the US to have slightly stronger dollar
17 because it dampens inflation. We don't import
18 as much inflation. It does serve to make our
19 goods less competitive abroad, and as US
20 corporations repatriate sales and revenue from
21 their activities abroad, it actually hurts the
22 performance and comes down a little bit.

23 As I have said, we have seen the dollar
24 weaken a little bit recently, and on the next
25 slide you can see some charts. When we last

1

Proceedings

2

spoke, the US dollar relative to the euro was

3

trading at about 97 percent. So each euro

4

bought 97 cents. Today it buys a dollar 4.

5

The British pound was buying about a dollar 3

6

at its bottom and now buys over a dollar 20

7

and finally US dollar was buying 150 yen and

8

now buys about 139. So it is a little bit

9

weaker over the course of the last couple of

10

weeks and months.

11

On the next slide, I love the first

12

upper left-hand side headline. "Bonds may be

13

having their worst year yet". And if you read

14

the content below, it says, "since at least

15

1926 and maybe in centuries". Now, the good

16

news is it says most of the damage is behind

17

us which I suspect is probably correct given

18

the artificially compressed levels we saw at

19

the early part of the year. We saw volatility

20

in both stocks and bonds although that's come

21

off a bit particularly in stocks and the bond

22

market rally and stock market rally have

23

increased as expectations for rate hikes slow

24

down occurred.

25

On the next slide, one of my favorite

1 Proceedings

2 Bloomberg slide. Actually meeting with Ed
3 yesterday, we went through this. This is
4 really remarkable when you look at the far
5 right-hand side. The basis point yield
6 changes that we have seen across the developed
7 markets and sovereign debt, so again US
8 treasury 10 years moving up 220 basis points
9 year to date through early this week. It's
10 pretty remarkable. Again, the moves of this
11 magnitude is not typically seen in a bond
12 market. On the next slide, as I mentioned
13 market volatility when we last met, the VIX
14 was about 30. On average over the last 30
15 years it's coming in 19. This morning it's
16 printing around 20, so it's come down quite a
17 bit in equity land. On the far right-hand
18 side you can see the IMOVE index is still
19 elevated as bond prices continue to see a fair
20 bit of volatility, which I think will
21 continue.

22 On the next slide, market returns on the
23 left-hand side, you can see those are equity
24 market returns, the Russell 3000 in blue, the
25 developed non-US international in gray, and

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

Proceedings

the emerging market equities in red. All of those are down. The Russell 3000 still down about 18 percent year to date, developed ex-US down 23 percent, and emerging markets continues to struggle at a little below negative 30. On the right-hand side, again unprecedented, the Barclays Ag -- should say the Bloomberg Ag as it's been renamed -- down about 16 percent year to date again, which is a fairly dramatic move you can see over the ten-year period. It's quite unusual. On the next slide, just look 60/40 split portfolio underperforming by about 16 percent so the balanced 60/40 portfolio again unprecedented in terms of its downside exposure.

And lastly, just a couple of headlines.

Other things that are interesting in the market. On the upper right-hand side, FTX collapse has been obviously a lot of issues around crypto. Currency selloffs associated with those assets, bankruptcy filings, so again that risk asset is not performing very well recently. I think that will probably continue.

1 Proceedings

2 Below that, just a sense that we have
3 had three British prime ministers in three
4 months which has been an incredible amount of
5 volatility, and on the upper right-hand side
6 we have seen credit spreads for Credit Suisse
7 widen pretty dramatically. The 5-year credit
8 default swap spreads yesterday were pricing
9 over 400 basis points, which is significant.
10 We will see where that goes. Ukraine war
11 continues to impact global growth and human
12 tragedy there as well.

13 And finally, on the lower right-hand
14 side, the China is still wrestling with COVID
15 and an increase in unrest associated with
16 COVID protocols. They may switch or any
17 change too in the coming weeks or months. The
18 next two slides, and I will get into the
19 performance just food for thought. Again,
20 there is no predictive value here, but this is
21 a chart of the VIX. Recently overlaid with
22 the VIX back in 2006 to 2009. It looked like
23 they pretty closely mirror one another.
24 Again, no predictive value but I think just
25 interesting to look at where the VIX is

1 Proceedings

2 relative to where it's been prior to the
3 market selloff. I think even perhaps more
4 interesting is the next slide, and again, I
5 have to caveat that there is no predictive
6 value, but this actually looks at the S & P
7 chart relative to the S & P back in 2006 to 9
8 and again, you can look where it starts to
9 really drop off in the green. That's during
10 the Lehman default crisis in September 2008.
11 Again, no predictive value but just things to
12 think about.

13 I think the US economy and the markets
14 have experienced certainly a rate shock. I
15 think there is an earnings shock coming
16 associated with the rate rise and potential
17 liquidities shock, so again no predictive
18 value, but my expectation, I wouldn't be
19 surprised to see increased volatility in the
20 first half of 2023. And on that happy note,
21 maybe move to the public market returns on
22 slide 32, Kate.

23 Again, it's been a tough year, tough
24 quarter and tougher year. You can see those
25 are the various benchmarks that are down

1 Proceedings

2 pretty substantially in the third quarter and
3 certainly for the year. So it's been a
4 challenging year to say the least. The
5 expected returns on the far right-hand side
6 are actually an average of the five
7 consultants across the five public pension
8 fund plans, but again, those expected returns
9 are over a ten-year period. That's more
10 informational value. I don't think that's a
11 fair comparison where we are in five years and
12 certainly not in one year.

13 On the next slide, this is actually a
14 look at the Teachers' performance relative to
15 strategy, and again tough quarter, tough year
16 with the exception in cash which unfortunately
17 we have zero official allocation or total
18 allocation to, but we do have some element of
19 cash to meet capital calls and distributions
20 but it's a challenging year. I think the
21 important thing to focus on, however, is
22 notwithstanding the pain we have seen recently
23 is five-year outcomes are actually still
24 pretty strong, and you have to look at the
25 significant drawdown in asset prices in 2022

1 Proceedings

2 because it's been so substantial it's weighing
3 down on the 3- and 5-year returns as well.

4 On the next slide to speak a little bit
5 more positive, these are the private market
6 returns by strategy. You can see they held up
7 well certainly in one year in the plus zone
8 although they have come down a little bit.
9 These are as of marks in performance to June
10 30th of this year with the exception of OFI
11 which is mostly through September 30th. I
12 think most importantly you look at the 10-year
13 performance since inception, and the
14 performance has been quite solid. And I think
15 that the private markets have been a good
16 source of diversification and balance for the
17 portfolio year to date. Teachers' total plan
18 assets shows a return 3 months negative 4.7
19 percent for the third quarter and one year
20 down 14 percent. Again, challenging year and
21 challenging environment. However, it is
22 outperforming its policy return. Again, which
23 uses public market proxies for private assets
24 which kind of skews things a little bit, but
25 again in line with what we would expect given

1 Proceedings
2 the general market. On the next slide, Kate,
3 just a look at the performance. So the good
4 news, the excess return is about 97 basis
5 points. That's largely driven by investment
6 manager selection on the far right-hand side
7 of 106 basis points. On the next slide, just
8 a look at the public market excess returns.
9 Again, it's been a challenging year but there
10 is some glimmer of light here. In three
11 months, we have been seen slight
12 outperformance in emerging market equities and
13 core fixed income. As well as an ETI mandate
14 which is relatively small on a comparative
15 basis, but again, I try to focus more on the
16 five-year excess returns what we have done in
17 the longer time horizon, which is a bit more
18 positive. Obviously the thing that stands out
19 to me on the slide is the one-year excess
20 returns in the world ex-US and emerging
21 markets down 561 basis points and 252 basis
22 points respectively. It's been a tough year
23 in those particular strategies, and I know
24 John Merseburg is here and can certainly
25 answer questions on how that's occurred, where

1 Proceedings

2 we think this goes over time.

3 And one more slide. Private market
4 excess returns, a much more positive story.
5 Certainly for one year, three years, five
6 years, and since inception with the one caveat
7 or the one exception of the private real
8 estate noncore opportunistic at negative 760
9 basis points. That's due to the fact that a
10 lot of the recent investments are still in the
11 J curve period where they are subject to
12 capital calls but not distributions. There is
13 also a little bit of a drag associated with
14 multifamily exposure in New York City housing
15 with rent control and rent freezes that kind
16 of hurt some of the valuations of the
17 underlying holdings. Also the fact that
18 Teachers was investing in real estate ahead of
19 and into and through the Global Financial
20 Crisis has been a little bit of a drag, and
21 finally the hotels, we have had some COVID
22 exposure that have hurt hotels and retail
23 space. This is reflected in that one area of
24 underperformance. I did go through this with
25 John Gluszak, our asset class head of real

1 Proceedings

2 estate yesterday, and he actually gave me a
3 couple of interesting statistics that I wanted
4 to share.

5 So if you look at the performance from
6 the vintage 2002 through 2010, real estate
7 investments in core and noncore, they are up
8 about 8.5 percent, generating 8.5 percent
9 annual return, and from 2011 to 2018 again
10 outside of that J curve, they have produced
11 returns of 14 and a half percent and relative
12 to its public market equivalent benchmark,
13 it's about 500 basis points over. So it's a
14 good story. Not a great story but very good
15 story in terms of where we are more recently.
16 One more slide. Just a look at the
17 rebalancing, Kate.

18 We have John Merseburg here. I went
19 through this with him yesterday. Most of the
20 rebalancing was really to adjust our equity
21 capital market weightings as well as to move
22 from the Russell 1000 to the Russell top 200.
23 But nothing dramatic or unusual about those
24 changes. And last slide, Kate.

25 Just a look at our under and

1 Proceedings

2 overweights, and again we traditionally have
3 been overweight cash because we have a zero
4 target allocation. And other than that, we
5 are pretty much in line with every strategy
6 and every underlying asset class.

7 Any questions? I know I kind of have
8 gone through this quickly. Bryan?

9 MR. BERGE: So that's pretty dire macro
10 economically overall and my reaction is to try
11 to find glimmers of hope and I need you to
12 defeat that reaction of mine. Is it wrong to
13 view recent yield curve movement and the
14 weakening of the currency relative to other
15 countries also experiencing inflation as a
16 market indicator of reduced future inflation
17 in the United States? Which I mean, that
18 seems to be driving everything these days.
19 Like what inflection is likely?

20 MR. MEIER: I think it's also
21 perception, so we have had Fed Chair Powell
22 yesterday gave some very interesting remarks.
23 What's interesting it does look like the Fed
24 is in a -- we talked about the pace of rate
25 hikes likely to moderate as early as December

1 Proceedings

2 period of time. So again, it's hard to be
3 optimistic when you think the economy is going
4 to slow at some point, and again with the bond
5 markets spread, it may precipitate a recession
6 at some point which has an impact on earnings.

7 So I looked at the market reaction
8 yesterday with the NASDAQ up over 4 percent
9 and I think it's just early and I think the
10 market wants to rally. Some of it may be more
11 technically driven, but my expectations are
12 and my gut tells me 2023 is going to be a
13 little bit more challenging, certainly in the
14 first half of the year. As we get past the
15 Fed -- I think the Fed will be done hiking
16 rates by perhaps the first quarter depending
17 upon the data and see where that goes, the
18 impact on earnings, the multiples have come
19 down and compressed. I am more optimistic if
20 that's a better way to answer the question for
21 the second half of next year.

22 MR. BERGE: So it sounds like your view
23 it may be beyond the bearish side of things at
24 least in the short term. Does that at all
25 inform the activities that BAM will undertake

1 Proceedings

2 in the short term, or is that just something
3 that, you know, do you take action on?

4 MR. MEIER: We do at the margin. So
5 that's a great question. We have an asset
6 allocation given to us by the trustees that we
7 adhere to. We are meant not to be nimble for
8 a reason. We are supposed to be long-term
9 investors. We are not supposed to overreact
10 to headlines although now that I say that, I
11 used the headlines in the presentation, but we
12 are supposed to be stable and consistent
13 investors. But I will give an example of a
14 couple -- one of the deals we looked at for
15 OFI. Torchlight which we really like a lot,
16 and it's one of the reasons why I particularly
17 prefer them is because they are relatively
18 defensive and when they came and presented to
19 us, they told us what they are doing with
20 their portfolio that they are investing in
21 higher credit quality, shorter maturities,
22 higher in the cap structure relative to
23 another deal we looked at. When we went to
24 greenlight them at the investment committee,
25 we opted not to go forward because we thought

1 Proceedings

2 they used too much leverage and it was too
3 aggressive for the environment. So yes, at
4 the deal level and management level we are
5 less aggressive.

6 MR. BERGE: Thank you very much.

7 MS. PENNY: Any other questions for
8 Steve? Okay. Hearing none, do I hear a
9 motion to go into executive session?

10 MR. BROWN: So moved.

11 MS. PENNY: Thank you, Mr. Brown. Do I
12 have a second?

13 MR. KAZANSKY: Second.

14 MS. PENNY: Thank you, Mr. Kazansky.
15 All those in favor, please say aye.

16 Aye.

17 MS. HIRSH: Aye.

18 MR. BUCKLEY: Aye.

19 MR. BERGE: Aye.

20 MR. KAZANSKY: Aye.

21 MR. BROWN: Aye.

22 MS. PENNY: Any opposed? Any
23 abstentions? Okay. We are going into
24 executive session.

25 (Discussion off the record.)

1 Proceedings

2 MS. PENNY: Back into public session.

3 Ms. Stang, would you like to report out,
4 please?

5 MS. STANG: Certainly. In executive
6 session we received some preliminary
7 performance data. We received implementation
8 plans for two asset classes. Consensus was
9 reached on both. We discussed and received a
10 presentation about an investment policy issue.
11 We received presentations on three private
12 equity deals. Consensus was reached on one.

13 MS. PENNY: Thank you so much. Does
14 anyone have anything else for public? Hearing
15 none, do I hear a motion to adjourn?

16 MR. KAZANSKY: So moved.

17 MS. PENNY: Thank you, Mr. Kazansky. Do
18 I have a second?

19 MR. BROWN: Second.

20 MS. PENNY: All those in favor of
21 adjourning, please say aye.

22 Aye.

23 MS. HIRSH: Aye.

24 MR. BUCKLEY: Aye.

25 MR. BERGE: Aye.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

Proceedings

MR. KAZANSKY: Aye.

MR. BROWN: Aye.

MS. PENNY: Opposed? Okay. We stand
adjourned.

(Time noted: 1:37 p.m.)

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

Proceedings

C E R T I F I C A T E

STATE OF NEW YORK)

: ss.

COUNTY OF QUEENS)

I, YAFFA KAPLAN, a Notary Public
within and for the State of New York, do
hereby certify that the foregoing record of
proceedings is a full and correct
transcript of the stenographic notes taken
by me therein.

IN WITNESS WHEREOF, I have hereunto
set my hand this 13th day of December,
2022.

YAFFA KAPLAN